

CONGRUENT AND INCONGRUENT COLLOCATIONS TOWARDS A BILINGUAL PREPOSITION AND NOUN COLLOCATIONS DICTIONARY OF ENGLISH AND INDONESIAN

Dewi Wulan Sari

Gunadarma University, dewi_wulansari@staff.gunadarma.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Collocation is a combination of words in a language that happens very often and more frequently than it would happen by chance. The writer chooses this topic because collocation is a serious problem for most Indonesian students. The problems of this research are (1) What are the equivalents of English preposition + noun collocation in Indonesian?, (2) Which preposition + noun collocations are congruent identified in the Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English?, (3) Which preposition + noun collocations are incongruent identified in the Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English?. The aims in this research are (1) To find out the equivalents of the sentences containing English preposition + noun collocations in Indonesian. (2) To find out the congruent preposition + noun collocations from the data found in the Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Student of English. (3) To find out the incongruent preposition + noun collocations from the data found in the Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Student of English. The source of the data was Oxford Collocations Dictionary for Students of English. The number of collocations taken as the sample of the data was 2050 English preposition + noun collocations. Qualitative and Quantitative methods are used in this research. The results of this research are (1) the result of the translation shows congruent, incongruent, and non-collocation, (2) 401 (19,56%) congruent collocations "preposition + noun" are found, (3) 1584 (77,27%) incongruent collocations "preposition + noun" are found, (4) 65 (3,17%) non-collocations are found.

Keywords: collocation, congruent, incongruent, preposition, noun.

INTRODUCTION

The big challenges faced by Indonesian people, who learn English, include how to express their thought naturally in English, is related to the collocation. "Collocation is a combination of words in a language that happens very often and more frequently than would happen by chance" (Hornby, 2010, p. 279). There is no rule to make the correct collocations, it happens because of it commonly occurs together as a set of combinations. Most Indonesian learners are not aware of the proper form of the collocation that should be used, so this will cause confusion or miscommunication when

speaking with the native English speaker. One of the biggest problems in both learning and using collocation is its arbitrary nature that makes most of English learners confuse about why this word should be combine with that word to make a right combination of collocation, that is no rule for it.

Due to these reasons, it will be hard to avoid unexpected error in producing the appropriate collocations. Errors in collocation may occur because of Indonesian as their first language influence the using of English language. Lack of knowledge about collocation is also one of the causes of an error made by Indonesian learners. For example, in

English we do not say 'bitter coffee' but 'strong coffee', but in Indonesian we say 'bitter coffee' instead of 'strong coffee'. In Indonesian we also do not say 'round-trip ticket' but 'return go ticket', but In English we have to say 'round-trip ticket' instead of 'return-go ticket'.

Bilingual collocation dictionary is needed by Indonesian learners to learn more about collocation. Bilingual collocation dictionary will make learners easy to understand collocation because the meaning of English Collocation is transferred to the equivalent Indonesian Collocation. So, it can reveal the differences of word's combinations in English and Indonesian collocation. Unfortunately, the Bilingual Collocation Dictionary, especially English – Indonesian, is rare to find.

Based on the description above the writer is interested in conducting a research entitled "Congruent and Incongruent Collocations: Towards a Bilingual Preposition + Noun Collocations Dictionary of English – Indonesia". The aims of this research are to find out the equivalents of the sentences containing English preposition + noun collocations in Indonesian, to find out the congruent preposition + noun collocations from the data found in the *Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Student of English*, to find out the incongruent preposition + noun collocations from the data found in the *Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Student of English*.

In English, collocation is divided into two major groups; they are grammatical collocation and lexical collocation. Benson, Benson, Ilson (1997) as cited in Martyńska (2004, p.3) stated that "grammatical collocation consists of the main word (a

noun, an adjective, a verb) plus a preposition or 'to+infinitive' or 'that-clause' and is characterized by 8 basic types of collocations".

The grammatical collocations fall into eight basic types. They are G1 which consists of noun+preposition, G2 consists of noun+to infinitive, G3 consists of noun+that clause, G4 consists of preposition+noun, G5 consists of adjective+preposition, G6 consists of predicative adjective+to infinitive, G7 consists of adjective+that clause, G8 consists of Nineteen English verb patterns (verb + to-infinitive, verb + bare infinitive, etc).

Bahns (1993) as cited in Martyńska (2004, p.3) stated that "lexical collocations do not contain grammatical elements, but are combinations of nouns, adjectives, verbs, adverbs". There are seven types of lexical collocation. They are L1 (Verb (transitive + noun/ pronoun (or prepositional phrase), L2 (Verb meaning essentially eradiction + and/or nullification + noun), L3 (adjective + noun), L4 (noun + verb), L5 (a noun (unit) + of + noun), L6 (adverb + adjective), L7 (verb + adverb).

There are congruent and incongruent collocation. Based on Hornby in *Oxford Dictionary* (2010), "congruent is having the same size and shape; suitable for something; appropriate in a particular situation" (p. 306). Based on the definition in *Oxford Dictionary*, it can be concluded that collocation can be said congruent when the words in source language and the words in target language are the same based on the context and the meaning both in Indonesian and in English language. It is because they are appropriate and suitable in the situation which is referred in the source language, for example English

collocation “keep talkie ng” is equivalent with “*terus berbicara*”.

Maurer-Stroh, 2004, stated that “congruent collocation is semantic predictability and they reveal the same structure” (p. 47). Semantic predictability means that the equivalent of collocation is predictable, can be known in advance, and the equivalent can be guessed. It means that the equivalent of English Collocation in Indonesian can be easily known without any difficulty. Moreover, Maurer-Stroh also stated that congruent collocation reveals the same structure. It means, if the collocation that is translated by word-for-word translation by English learner from Indonesian to English or vice versa is acceptable in the equivalence; it can be called that the collocations are congruent. Maurer-Stroh statement about semantic predictability will be the reference to categorize collocation into congruent and incongruent collocation.

Incongruent collocation is the inverse form of congruent collocation. Incongruent collocations are harder to be identified than the congruent collocations because they are unpredictable and exhibit different structure. It is clear that incongruent collocation cannot be translated by word-by-word translation. According to Yamashita and Jiang (2010, as cited in Szudarki, 2012:625) stated that “the learning of incongruent collocations will lag behind that of congruent ones’, for incongruent collocations require more processing effort”. The example of incongruent collocations are “delivery room” which equivalent with “*ruang melahirkan*” and “round trip ticket” which equivalent with “*tiket pulang pergi*”.

Some often consider collocation as word combination. “Combination is two or more things joined or mixed

together to form a single unit” (Hornby, 2010, p. 282). Based on the meaning of combination, it can be said that word combination is the act of joining two or more words to form a meaningful unit. Every collocation is word combination, but not every word combination is collocation. Word combination can be collocation, free combinations, idiom, etc. Collocation is different with word combination, because collocation is fixed and identified combinations.

It will be a little bit difficult for the English learners to differentiate between collocation and idiom. Collocations are semantically transparent, i.e. their meanings can be derived from the denotative meaning of their constituents, but the elements cannot be freely substituted. Moreover, “idiom is an isolated fact which cannot be inferred from the meaning of the words of which the idiom is made up” (Stroh, 2004, p. 26). For example, when we say “*give somebody red carpet*” it does not mean the true the carpet that has red colours. The idiom *red carpet* means a special treatment because someone is very important.

Contrastivity derived from contrastive which shows the differences between languages. The contrastivity also comes between English and Indonesian collocations. We have to comprehend collocation in the English Language while we have to produce the equivalent meaning in Indonesian language. It is like dealing with two side of the same coin.

Nida and Taber (1982, as cited in Putrantri, 2019:98) “say that translating consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalence of a source language message, firstly in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style”. This means that translation must be done by producing an equivalent text message

from source language naturally in order to create the equal meaning when it is translated into the target language. "Equivalence is derived from equivalent that means equal in value, amount, meaning, importance" (Hornby, 2010:494). Good translation must not ignore about the equivalent between the source language and the target language, because translating is a process in reproducing the same meaning from one language to the other language, where natural equivalent is needed. When the equivalent is ignored in the process of translating, the translation result will be meaningless and can cause misunderstanding.

RESEARCH METHOD

In conducting this research, the researcher uses quantitative method and qualitative method. As quantitative method generates numerical data or information that can be converted, it is used to count how many data that are found. While qualitative method is ways of collecting data, which are concerned with describing meaning. Qualitative method provides more in depth and rich description. Based on the explanation, qualitative method is used because this research uses an interpretation of the data.

The data source of this research is *Oxford Collocations Dictionary for Students of English*. The researcher chose 2050 preposition + noun collocations as the data of this research. The researcher collected the data systematically. First, the researcher read the *Oxford Collocations Dictionary for Students of English* while identifying kinds of collocations. After the preposition + noun collocations were identified in the *Oxford Collocations Dictionary for Students of English*, the identified preposition + noun collocations were listed alphabetically.

The researcher chose 2050 preposition + noun collocations and each preposition + noun collocations were given the example in the form of sentences or phrases. The next step is, the writer translated the sentences or phrases, which contained the preposition + noun collocations. Based on the translated sentences or phrases, the researcher found the equivalent of the preposition + noun collocations. Finally, the equivalents were used to identified whether those collocations are congruent or incongruent.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The result of the research is that there are 3788 pairs of collocation but the researcher limited it only to 2050 preposition + noun collocation to be analyzed further. The researcher found the Indonesian equivalent of the 2050 preposition + noun English collocation and it led to the categorization of congruent and incongruent collocation.

The results of the data analysis, are not only include the number of congruent and incongruent collocations, but also the form of English Collocations that become single word in Indonesian which is called non-collocation by the researcher. Of 2050 English preposition+noun collocations, 401 (19,56%) are congruent, 1584 (77,27%) are incongruent, and 65 (3,17%) are non-collocation. This can be seen in the following table and pie chart.

From the table (1) above, it can be seen that 1.584 (77,27%) are identified as incongruent collocation, because the equivalent of the collocations in English and Indonesian are structurally not the same. So that, the number of preposition + noun incongruent collocation is dominating. Congruent collocations took the second place, as there are found 401 (19,56%)

prepositions + noun combinations which are the equivalent in English and Indonesian. It means that they have the same meaning and structure. 65 (3,17%) of the equivalent of English Collocations word in Indonesian are single word, so it cannot be called as collocation and it is categorized into non-collocation by the researcher. The examples of the analysis of English preposition + noun collocations can be seen below. They lead to the categorization of congruent, incongruent and non-collocation

Congruent Collocation

English collocation and its translation in Indonesian can be called congruent, if the English Collocation can be translated literally into Indonesian according to the given context and sounds natural to native Indonesian speakers.

After means later than something; following something in time (Hornby, 2010, p. 26) and dark in English means with no or very little light, especially because it is night” (Hornby, 2010, p. 368). In the context given after is equivalent in *sesudah* or *setelah* in Indonesian. Meanwhile, the situation describes in the definition of dark is known as *gelap* in Indonesian, as stated in KBBI from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/gelap>, that *gelap* is *tidak ada cahaya; kelam; tidak terang* (the condition where there is no light). Based on the explanation above, it is clear that the collocation has the same contextual meaning in both languages. The equivalent of ‘after dark’ is *setelah gelap*. As a result, the collocation is categorized as congruent.

Preposition close to means in a position very near to something (Hornby, 2010, p. 266), in Indonesian it is *dekat dengan*. The word nature means all the plants, animals, and things that

exist in the universe that are not made by people (Hornby, 2010, p. 983) this term is the same as *segala yang ada di langit dan di bumi (seperti bumi, bintang, kekuatan); yang bukan buatan manusia* (all the things in the sky and earth (as earth, star, power) which are not made by people) (<https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/alam>) which is also known as *alam*. Based on the meaning explained above, the equivalent of ‘close to nature’ in Indonesian is *dekat dengan alam* and it is categorized into congruent collocation.

In *Oxford Dictionary*, ‘for’ is used to show who is intended to have or to use something or where something is intended (Hornby, 2010:583). In the sentence above ‘for’ is translated into ‘untuk’ which means *kata depan untuk menyatakan bagi* (<https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/untuk>). Charity is the aim of giving money, food, etc, to people who are in need (Hornby, 2010:235). In Indonesian, ‘charity’ is *amal*, that means *perbuatan baik yg dilakukan dng tujuan untuk berbuat kebaikan thd masyarakat atau sesama manusia (memberi derma, mengumpulkan dana untuk membantu korban bencana alam, penyandang cacat, orang jompo, anak yatim piatu, dsb)* (<https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/amal>). Based on the explanation, the meaning of ‘charity’ in English and Indonesian is the same. According to the context find above, ‘for charity’ is congruent with *untuk amal*.

Incongruent Collocation

Incongruent collocations happen when English Collocations cannot be translated into Indonesian in word-by-word translation. Each word of English Collocation may have different meaning in Indonesian.

In English, between means in or into the space separating two or more points, objects, people, etc (Hornby, 2010, p. 127). 'Between' is known as *di antara* in Indonesian, which means *di tengah dua benda (orang, tempat, batas, dsb)* (<https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/antara>). Sob is an act or the sound of sobbing (Hornby, 2010, p. 1413). In Indonesian, it means *tersedu-sedu*. Based on the explanation above, English Collocation 'between sobs' is equivalent in *sambil tersedu-sedu*. The equivalent in Indonesian is really different in English, so the collocation is categorized into incongruent collocation.

Beyond means on or to the further side, more than something (Hornby, 2010, p. 128). In Indonesian, beyond is known as *melampaui* or *melewati*. Recovery means the process of becoming well again after an illness or injury (Hornby, 2010, p. 1230). The literal meaning in Indonesian is *pemulihan* or *dipulihkan*. But based on the context given, beyond means something more than *melampaui*, the meaning closes to *tidak dapat*. So, based on the explanation above, the equivalent of beyond recovery is *tidak dapat dipulihkan* and it is categorized into incongruent collocation.

From is used to show what the origin of somebody or something is and also used to show where somebody or something starts (Hornby, 2010:602), in Indonesian it is *dari* or *sejak*. Dictation means the act of speaking or reading so that somebody can write down the word (Hornby, 2010:403). That action is called *mendikte* in Indonesian. Somehow, the collocation cannot be fully translated based on the meaning of each word. The message of the sentence is someone who feels so difficult if he/she has to write letters/word by

hearing someone speaking or reading. So, from dictation means *jika di dikte* not *dari/sejak mendikte*. Based on the explanation, it can be seen that the collocation is categorized into incongruent. English Collocation from dictation means *jika di dikte* in Indonesian.

Non-Collocation

When the equivalent of English Collocation in Indonesian is a single word, the equivalent in Indonesia cannot be categorized as collocation. Because it is cannot be categorized in congruent or incongruent, the researcher calls it as non-collocation.

For means used to show who is intended to have or used something or where something is intended to be put (Hornby, 2010, p. 583). Instance is a particular example or case of something (Hornby, 2010, p. 778). It is translated different from the meaning of each words. Here, for instance is translated as *misalnya*. The equivalent of English Collocation for instance is simply in single word, *misalnya*. Based on the definition above, for instance is categorized into non-collocation.

The word in means at a point with or during the period of time (Hornby, 2010. P. 756), while action is the process of doing something in order to make something happen or to deal with a situation (Hornby, 2010, p. 13). Based on the meaning of each words, in action may be translated as *dalam bertindak*. In the context of the sentence where the collocation belongs, the collocation in action would be better and more natural if it is translated to *beroperasi*. Based on the explanation above, the most proper equivalent of in action is *beroperasi*. Because, in this sentence, someone emphasize to the machines work's process. And because

a machine cannot do anything, it is operated by human.

Tabel 1.
Congruent, Incongruent, and Non-Collocations

Kinds of Collocation	Frequency	Percentage
Congruent	401	19,56 %
Incongruent	1584	77,27 %
Non-Collocation	165	3,17 %
Total	2050	100 %

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 2.
Congruent Collocation Data 1

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
111	after dark	The girls weren't allowed out after dark. (<i>Para gadis tidak diperbolehkan keluar setelah gelap.</i>)	<i>setelah gelap</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 3.
Congruent Collocation Data 2

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
838	close to nature	People who live in the country and are close to the nature. (<i>Orang yang tinggal di desa dan dekat dengan alam.</i>)	<i>dekat dengan alam</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 4.
Congruent Collocation Data 3

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
1007	For charity	The school raised over a hundred pounds for charity. (<i>Sekolah ini mengumpulkan lebih dari seratus poundsterling untuk amal.</i>)	<i>Untuk amal</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 5.
Incongruent Collocation Data 1

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
653	Between sobs	I don't want to go!' she got out between sobs. (<i>'Saya tidak ingin pergi!' Dia pergi sambil tersedu-sedu.</i>)	<i>Sambil tersedu-sedu</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 6.
Incongruent Collocation Data2

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
676	Beyond recovery	The region has been damaged by acid rain and rivers are fouled almost beyond recovery. (<i>Wilayah ini telah rusak oleh hujan asam dan sungai-sungai yang tercemar hampir tidak dapat dipulihkan.</i>)	<i>Tidak dapat dipulihkan</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 7.
Incongruent Collocation Data 3

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
1103	From dictation	I find it difficult to write letters from dictation. (<i>Saya kesulitan untuk menulis huruf jika di dikte.</i>)	<i>Jika di dikte</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 8.
Non-Collocation Data 1

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
1031	For instance	Murder, petty theft and tax evasion, for instance, all have different motives and consequences. <i>(Pembunuhan, pencurian kecil dan penggelapan pajak, misalnya, semua memiliki motif dan konsekuensi yang berbeda.)</i>	<i>Misalnya</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

Table 9.
Non-Collocation Data 2

Data Number	English Preposition+Noun Collocations	Examples	Indonesian Preposition+Noun Collocations
1622	In action	I have not yet seen the machines in action. <i>(Saya belum pernah melihat mesin-mesin beroperasi.)</i>	<i>beroperasi</i>

Source: Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English, 2005

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Based on the analysis conducted the equivalent of English preposition + noun collocations fall into three categories when they are translated into Indonesian. The three categories are congruent collocation, incongruent collocation, and non-collocation.

Among the 2050 data taken, 401 (19,56%) are categorized into congruent collocation. They are categorized into congruent when the original English collocation and its translation in Indonesian have the same structure and can be predicted semantically. 1584 (77,27%) of 2050 data are categorized into incongruent collocation. The collocations are called as incongruent because they have different structure

when they are translated. In this case, Incongruent collocations are often harder to be identified.

Through this research, the researcher also found that some English preposition + noun collocations are translated into single word in Indonesia. The single word cannot be called as collocation and the researcher called those as non-collocation. The number of non-collocations found in this research are 65 (3,17%).

The limitation of this research that is does not cover all collocational in the dictionary. As a result, the researcher suggests the future researcher to conduct research about another combinations of collocation. Besides, the researcher is also suggested to learn more about collocation in order to

enrich the knowledge, and to add the collocation as the subject in school or college, so the student will know more about collocation and decrease the number of errors in collocation made by Indonesian students.

REFERENCES

- Benson, et, al. 1997. *The BBI Dictionary Of English Word Combinations*. North America: John Benjamins B.V
- Hornby, A. S. 2010. *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary*. 8th ed. London: Oxford University Press.
- Martyńska, Małgorzata. 2004. Do English language learners know collocations?. *Investigationes Linguisticae*, vol. XI, Poznań, December 2004
- Maurer-Stroh, M. P. 2004. *Towards a Bilingual Adjective-Noun Collocation Dictionary of English and German*. German: Universität Klagenfurt.
- Putrantri. 2019. Modulation: A Translation Method to Obtain Naturalness in Target Language Texts. *Jurnal of Language and Literatute* ISSN: 1410-5691.
- Runcie, M. 2005. *Oxford Collocation Dictionary for Students of English*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Szudarki, P. 2012. Effects of Meaning- and Form-Focused Instruction on the Acquisition of Verb-Noun Cpllocations in L2 English. *Journal of Second Language Teaching and Research, Vol. 1 Issue 2 P. 3 – 37*.
- Websites:
KBBI Daring. Retrieved from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/Cari/Index>