SYMBOL OF WESTERN NEO-ORIENTALISM CRITICISM IN “MS. MARVEL”

Introduction

America’s political climate is polarized with issues of religion and race, which have even increased the prevalence of violence. Especially after the 9/11 tragedy, racism against a certain religion (Islam) is increasingly widespread (Shirazi, 2010). The Western view of Islam which is considered as radical, and terrorist is increasingly spreading.

Robingah, Firstiyanti, Ilafi, Suyudi, Sari, Symbol of Western...
Through discourse, text, media, America constructs Islam as a radical religion. The Western view, in this case America, is in accordance with the concept of neo-orientalism. The concept of neo-orientalism, which is a form of modern orientalist thought, is generally found in academic literature that criticizes Western attitudes towards the Islamic world.

Neo-orientalism has the same concept as "old-orientalism." Both concepts are about the West's view of the East. However, the concept of neo-orientalism reaffirms the representation of the East (Islam) as morally flawed. Orientalism according to Said (2001:2) is a way to understand the Eastern world, based on its special place in the human experience of Western Europe. Furthermore, Said emphasized that orientalism is a style of thinking made between "East" as (the Orient) and almost always "West" as (the occident). In orientalism, there is hegemony, the domination of the West over the east, how they judge, read, view the East from their point of view.

According to Alatas (2012), there are two types of Orientalism that develop in the world society, namely: (a) Old Orientalism. It is marked by the growing anti-Eastern spirit, various dichotomies (West - smart, East - stupid, West - diligent, East - lazy, etc.), which are based on various prejudices and stereotypes that are generally demeaning. In essence, the West is superior and the East is weak. However, in its development, science has relatively succeeded in overcoming or perhaps reducing this Old Orientalism, (b) New Orientalism, with regard to the dominance of Western versions of knowledge and the using of various standards (terms/definitions, methods, ways of analysis, conclusions) from the West (white man/white) has resulted the marginalized knowledge of local/minority communities. For example, according to Al Biruni, in the past local religions in India were called Brahma, Shiva, etc. However, the colonialists regarded these religions as one, namely Hinduism. While the early religions were more regarded as sects only.

In this New Orientalism, local concepts and knowledge are ignored in the development of social sciences. In the end, social science in all countries is influenced and controlled by knowledge from the West, especially from the 3 main sources of Western knowledge today, namely the United States, Britain and France (especially concerning the former colonial countries). Although neo-Orientalism represents a shift in subject choice and locale, it nevertheless reproduces certain repetitions and conceptual continuity with its predecessors. Like classical Orientalism, neo-Orientalism is a monolithic discourse based on a binarism
between superior American values and inferior Arab culture.

In the orientalism discourse, Said focuses on colonialist discourse. Meanwhile Homi K. Bhabha focuses on colonized discourse. Bhabha’s main concept in explaining the relationship between colonizers and colonized is the concept of time-lag, namely a split structure of colonial discourse. This split/divided condition makes the subject always be in the liminal space between cultures, where the dividing line is never fixed and the boundaries and ends cannot be known (Bhabha, 2004).

Bhabha’s most important work is a collection of essays entitled The Location of Culture and a book arranged by several authors including himself in Nation and Narration, third Space/Hybridity and Mimicry. These two issues are important from the perspective of identity politics, because they can provide perspectives for other studies such as popular culture studies, gender studies, minority studies, and subaltern studies.

Avoiding the bias of Edward Said’s analysis of colonialism which imagines the identity of colonizers and colonized as stable identities that do not change and are always in tension, Homi Bhabha provides an alternative reading of this relationship with more nuance and paradox. The solution offered is to uncover the space between the two established categories: the colonizer and the colonized. Bhabha calls this in-between space the third or hybrid space or liminal space (Bhabha, 2004). At this point, the colonized find their strategy of resistance against the domination of colonialist discourse. Not fighting in a frontal way, but rather with cultural “affairs”, that is by taking over colonial cultural signs, but being given content and being sued to produce a new identity and way of life. The wearing of beskap, western-origin suit combined with jarik, which is the official uniform among Javanese aristocrats, implies this dynamic.

But for creating this third space, Bhabha does not mind how much oppression colonialism does to the colonized. He is more concerned with how sharp the distinction between the two categories is, which he sees as perpetuating the binary opposition that has been criticized by the French thinker, Jacques Derrida (1930-2004). Derrida accuses Western discourse of being dominated by binarism which divides the two with strict identities such as white/black, West/East, colonizer/colonized, male/female, and so on.

On the other hand, third space provides a symbolic space for the colonized to carry out cultural manoeuvres by freeing themselves from the binarism. Instead of considering this attitude as a resistance to identity given by the colonialists, this situation actually shows identity formations that are constantly evolving.
changing and strategies of "surviving" from the dominance of the land culture. In other words, the resistance and cooperation between the colonizers and the colonized are mutually exclusive, but productively each of these categories produces and supports one another: the colonizer creates and feeds the colonized, so they can produce a new colonizer, and so on.

This third space is not simply subject to traditional categories such as "nation" and "ethnicity" but instead hides these boundaries. We can see this fact in a photo of the soldiers of Yogyakarta palace which combine Javanese and Dutch colonial elements. In the construction of traditional orientalism and the study of colonialism this was judged as the "subjection" of the colonized to the cultural domination of the Dutch colonizers, and from the perspective of the Dutch colonizers it was a sign of a "shallow" culture.

For Bhabha, this is precisely a cultural transformation through the third space created from the relationship between the two by the colonized. Rather than confronting the two in mutually opposing and hostile positions, the postcolonial Bhabha shows the delicacy of the colonized in fending off colonial cultural domination. But at the same time, this cultural product also shows ambivalence, a double heart.

Film is one of the media that can be used to represent a state of society in a region. Film can also be used as a medium to convey certain ideologies and thoughts. Film can also be used as a medium to criticize. Film is a product of popular culture which is currently in great demand, thrives and rapidly experiences significant developments in various layers of society, especially urban communities. In the perspective of the culture industry, popular culture is born because of the will of the media (Strinati, 2004). The media produce various types of popular culture, influenced by imported culture, and the results are disseminated through a global network of media.

Disney+ is one of the digital platform media that can currently be accessed in Indonesia. Disney+ launched in 2019, the streaming service caters to a wide range of audiences, including families, adults, and children. Quoting from demandsage.com, Disney+ has 161.8 million users worldwide. Besides, it has 2.012 movies and TV shows available on the platform globally. Through this channel platform, users can watch various types of films that are not only produced domestically. Disney+ is contemporary media, digital media that can be accessed through anything, whether through television screens or our gadget screens.
One of the series that recently broadcasted on Disney+ is a series entitled “Ms. Marvels”. Ms. Marvel is a 2022 American television miniseries for the Disney+ streaming service. This miniseries is created by Bisha K. Ali, who is a British-Pakistani woman. “Ms. Marvel is a series based on the Marvel Comics character Kamala Khan / Ms. Marvel. What’s interesting about the miniseries “Ms. Marvel” are the players, the director, the setting that takes two places, namely in a city, in the Canadian state, Jersey City, and Pakistan. The superhero, Ms. Marvel is a teenage girl of Pakistani American descent. Their family background is a Pakistani moslem family, living in America. This film is interesting to study. “Ms. Marvel” is produced by Marvel Studios, which is the production house of the Marvel franchise.

Research about identity construction, orientalism and neo-orientalism has been conducted by some researchers. First is, Research by Alyssa Syamina Putri and Herlin Putri Indah Destari. They research title is “On the Orientalism and Neo-orientalism in Ayad Akhtar’s Disgraced: Analysis on the Dynamics of Amir and Emily’s Relationship”. In this research, the researchers analysed three essentials elements of interracial relationship between Amir and Emily in Ayad Akhtar’s Pulitzer Prize-winning play, entitled Disgraced. The analysis utilised the combination of Identity Construction theory by Stuart Hall, Edward Said’s Orientalism, and the post 9/11 discourse of Neo-Orientalism. And the last part of the analysis they foregrounded the entire elements by utilising Stuart Hall’s theory of Articulation. The results of the research proved that Amir’s violence is an act of retaliation towards Emily’s domination over the production of his identity through representation and her influence in his crucial decisions concerning his relationship with his family. Emily’s victimisation and the emphasis on Amir’s ‘tribalistic bond’ risk a reductionist Neo-Orientalist reading of the text. By acknowledging Emily’s White Saviour Complex, the text can be read as a re-articulation of the Neo-Orientalist stereotypes of ‘barbaric brown man’ and ‘free white woman’ (Putri & Destari, 2019).

The second research is a research done by Syihabul Furqon and Busro entitled “Hibriditas Poskolonialisme Homi K. Bhabha dalam novel Midnight’s Children Karya Salman Rushdie”. In this research, the researchers wanted to review Salman Rushdie’s novel entitled Midnight’s Children to reveal the hybridity aspects. The researchers used Bhabha’s theory to find the hybridity aspects in the novel. The result showed that the researchers found a large number of hybridity identifications in the novel Midnight’s Children. Especially in the
aspects of identity (especially the formation of the subject), language, and inner struggle of characters in the novel (Furqon & Busro, 2020).

Based on the background, and the related researches, the researchers intend to examine the concept of identity using Homi K. Bhabha's post-colonial approach with the object, Miniseries entitled Ms. Marvel. After getting the concept of identity represented in this film, the researchers want to prove that the symbols contained in this miniseries are a form of criticism against the concept of Western neo-orientalism.

Method

This research used qualitative research. It relates to the existence of a phenomenon experienced by the subjects such as perceptions, motivations, behaviours and actions by means of descriptions in the form of words and language, in a special natural context and by utilizing various methods. (Moleong, 2005:6). The source of data is a series entitled “Ms. Marvel” which airs on Disney+ with a duration of 50-52 minutes per episode. "Ms Marvel" is an American television miniseries created by Bisha K. Ali and produced by Kevin Feige in 2022. The formal object is in the form of general descriptions and social problems in the form of words, narratives, dialogues, pictures and scenes in the film Ms. Wonder.

In collecting the data, the researchers carried out several steps, such as: 1) Watching all the episodes in the series "Ms. Marvel", 2) Listening and observing word by word concerning to how the characters in the series, which are dominated by Muslims, raise problems for the western world as contained in the film Ms. 3) Recording, categorizing, and presenting findings that are considered as important and interesting things related to Muslim behaviour that contains hybridity, mimicry and ambivalence). 4) As a process of checking the results, the authors make decisions and make judgments about which data should be presented and analysed.

After collecting data, the next process is analysing by applying steps such as: 1) Data reduction. Defined as a selection process, focusing on simplifying, abstracting, and transforming "rough" data that emerges from written records in the field. 2) Presentation of data. An organized collection of information that gives the possibility of drawing conclusions and taking action. 3) Drawing conclusions. The final step performed in the process is data analysis. (Sugiyono, n.d., 2017: 338-345) In the process of presenting the data, the researchers try to have strong evidence so that at the time of drawing conclusions it will be a credible conclusion.
Result and Discussion

The story begins with the scene of Kamala’s life, the Ms. Marvel. She lives in a Pakistani moslem family in Jersey City. Jersey is a city in the US where the Pakistan moslem community lives. Kamala has 2 best-friends, they are Bruno, an American boy, a genius, who always helps Kamala when she gets troubles. The second one is Kania. Kania is just like Kamala. She is Pakistan-American girl living in Jersey. Kania wears hijab or headscarf in her daily life.

Kamala’s family consists of mother, father, her older brother and Kamala. Even Kamala is a moslem, she does not wear hijab or headscarf. But when we see Kamala’s brother, we can directly know that he is not an American. He has a thick moustache, a brown skin. Aamir Khan is a typical protective older brother to Kamala. His last name, Khan, is represents his identity, as a moslem, and as a Pakistani. From Kamala’s family background, and Kamala’s best friends, we can see how the scriptwriter, the director show us the harmony of minority groups in country where the majority are not Asian, and not even Moslem. They show us the symbols of Pakistani family, appearances from Kamala’s family.

At the beginning, episode 1, there are several scenes showing Kamala is treated differently from her friends at school, because she is 'different', colored skin (brown). He does not have a lot of friends at school. only Bruno and Kania are her friends. Even his teacher called her 'Camelia', not Kamala. Kamala is an Islamic name, but her teacher called her Camelia, instead of her name, Kamala. Here we see that there is an act of racism that Kamala gets because she is 'different', because she is Muslim, brown-coloured skin, not like American girl generally, and because she is 'a minority'.

Representation of Neo-Orientalism in Ms. Marvel Series

Neo-orientalism refers to western efforts to dominate the world, specifically the Islamic world after the September 11 tragedy in US. The Islamic world is placed as an important target that needs to be achieved because the biggest challenge to the US comes from Muslims. The form of domination, the concept of neo-orientalism is shown in Ms. Marvel series. The first scene where the Department of Damage Control (OODC) forced their way in, wanted to search the mosque without a permit, a letter of order from their superiors, was proof of the existence of power. They (security forces who are Western, white) carried out a search of the mosque which was included in the 'private space' of a place of worship, not according to the rules, not on the basis of an order. In fact, there is a 'law and order'. The
A search was carried out only based on the presence of 'allegations/allegations against people with brown skin, Muslims' who were made suspect by them. Here one can see a form of neo-orientalism practiced by the west (whites) against people of colour, especially Islam, as stated by Tuastad (2003) described as how Neo-Orientalists view violence by brown people as the proof of the backwardness of their culture and has no connection whatsoever with other motives such as politics or economics.

According to Hall, stated in (Putri & Destari, 2019), cultural/ethnic/ethnic identity, in this context, is not simply formed. It has a history behind it, there is a past connection. ‘Cultural identity, in this second sense, is a matter of ‘becoming’ as well as of ‘being’. It belongs to the future as much as to the past. It is not something which already exists, transcending place, time, history and culture. Cultural identities come from somewhere, have histories (Hall, 1990).

In Ms. Marvel series, it is explained the origins of Kamala's family, Kamala's great-grandmother, Aisha. In this series, it is told about expansion, British colonialism in India, and how the separation occurred between India, which is predominantly Hindu and Pakistan, which is Muslim, which was caused by British colonialism. In Ms. Marvel, also explained that their identity as 'Pakistan' was formed by the British, not of their will. The religious conflict was created by the British.

At the end of Episode 4, Kamala is thrown back to 1947. Then in Episode 5 we are presented with a story about the struggle of the British Indians to catch the last train leaving one night. Episode 5 takes the background of the story of the past of the Kamala family (Kamala's great-grandfathers to be precise) in Pakistan, where the separation between India and Pakistan occurred after trying to gain independence from the British colony.

British India refers to pre-independence India, Bangladesh, Pakistan and Myanmar where these areas were under British colonial rule as part of the pre-independence British Empire. The term refers only to the subcontinent processes which were directly under the British administration in Delhi and previously in Kolkata.

Reporting from the Hindustian Times, the director, Sharmeen Obaid-Chinoy, as a native of Pakistan, felt an extraordinary moment in realizing a historical story that was painful for the local people. He was even in a phase of disbelief that Partitions of India could be featured in a Marvel Studios project. One quote that describes how painful this event is:

"My passport is Pakistani and my roots are Indian. And in between is aborder,
The Partition of India that occurred at the end of British colonial rule was the largest human movement in history, outside of war and famine. About 12 million people became refugees and between 500,000 and one million people died in religiously based violence.

But in this series, Ms. Marvel depicts it through a present-day lens, creating a multi-generational tale of trauma, loss and identity. Ms. Marvel is classified as a film for ages 13+. The elements of violence that occurred in the partition were not described. It does not explain further about British colonialism and how the British manipulated the three largest religions in India at that time (Islam, Hinduism, Sikh) so that civil war broke out. Just a glimpse of the romance of meeting Kamala’s grandparents during the late British colonial era in India.

The main plot, the main story of Ms. Marvel too, is looking into the origins of Kamala’s grandmother, Sana. There are big questions that have not been answered about their origins. What Grandma Sana knows is that the passport she has is a Pakistani passport, while her family is from India. In the series, it is showed that at the time, India and Pakistan were one country. They lived side by side, but when the British colonized India, there was a separation. Those who are predominantly Hindu, remain in India. While those who are Muslim, forced to emigrate, leaving India. Whereas before, they lived side by side, both fought against British colonialism.

This part is the difference between Captain Marvel, which is an American Superhero film and the Ms. Marvel series. In the Ms. Marvel series, it is thick with Muslim culture, Pakistan. Even though they both carry the concept of a superhero, but in Ms. Marvel, the superhero, comes from a Muslim family, Pakistan. It is also a form of evidence of criticism of the concept of neo-colonialism. Pakistani culture, Pakistani nuances, and Islam are presented in this series.

Even, in one scene, there is scene of the Eid celebration, it is also featured in this series. How solidarity, togetherness, ethnic Pakistani people who live in the city of Jersey are also shown in this series. The scriptwriter of this series, who is also a British-Pakistani woman, seems to want to illustrate that Islam, Asia, can coexist with the West, white people. It is as if the writer wants to fight against the concepts of orientalism or neo-orientalism constructed by the West, especially after the 9/11 tragedy. Religious symbols, such as mosques, Al-Qur’an, Eid al-Fitr celebrations are the evidences as forms of criticism of the concept of neo-orientalism showed in this series.
In addition, the director also raised the concept of gender equality, respect for women as shown in Islam. And this is contrary to the Western view against Islam, where they consider Islam to be a backward religion, which does not respect women, acts arbitrarily, commits violence against women. But in this series, the director constructs gender equality. In Ms. Marvel series, Kania, who is Kamala’s best friend, wants to be on the mosque’s board of directors. Previously, the board of trustees of the mosque was a man and old. But in this series, the director shows the figure of Kania, as a young woman, who is ultimately elected as the mosque’s board of directors, a female figure, still young. And there is no debate, or conflict with the election of Kania.

We can see the construction of Muslim women presented in Ms. Marvel, which is of course different from the Western view of Islam. From the scene where Kamala’s friend, Kania is chosen to be the board director of the mosque. All of the board candidates are men, except Kania. But Kania proves it that she is competent enough to be the board directors. This proves that Islam recognizes the concept of gender equality, where woman can a leader in a community. Islam recognizes this equality. Gender equality is not a Western understanding/concept. Islam has praised and respect women and it is presented in this series.

**Mimicry, Hybridity in Ms. Marvel Series**

According to (Epafras, 2012) to avoid the bias of Edward Said’s analysis of colonialism which imagines the identity of colonizers and colonized as stable identities that do not change and are always in tension, Homi Bhabha provides an alternative reading of this relationship with more nuance and paradox. The solution it offers is to uncover the space between the two established categories: the colonizer and the colonized. Bhabha calls this in-between space the third or hybrid space or liminal space. It is in this threshold space that the colonized find a strategy of resistance against the domination of colonialist discourse. Not fighting in a frontal way, but rather by "crossing" cultures, that is by taking over colonial cultural signs, but being given content and being used so as to produce a new identity and way of life. Lacan gives the meaning of mimicry to Bhabha, namely that mimicry is not only imitating others but the process of imitation is also a subversive resistance.

In the series of Ms. Marvel, there is a third space identity or what is known as hybridity. There is a cultural 'affair' as stated by Bhabha in his concept:

In episode 4 in this series, it started by the story of Kamala and her mother visiting her grandmother in Karachi, a city in Pakistan. It is their own country, their hometown. On the next day, Kamala go
Robingah, Firstiyanti, Ilafi, Suyudi, Sari, Symbol of Western...
https://doi.org/10.35760/jll.2023.v11i1.8093

around the town with her cousins. They do the city tour and Kamala wanted to go to the old train station, Karachi Station. This train station is the place where the separation event took place. The place where Kamala's grandmother lost from his father. In this station, there is a restricted area, an area where it is not used anymore. Kamala's walks through this area. In this area, there is a scene which shows us that the wall of this area is painted. The picture or the mural on the wall, is in the form of a superhero, with is an inscription: “YOU CAN START SMALL AND STILL BE LARGER THAN LIFE. KARACHI X AVENGER SERIES, PT 4”.

The picture on the wall in the Karachi Station is a prove that Superhero concept, Avengers not only exists in the West, in the US, but also in Pakistani, a moslem country, an Asian country. They also have superheroes, they made their version of the Avengers. It can be seen from the murals in one of the stations, in Karachi, Pakistan. Apart from these murals, in the Ms. Marvel series, the director also shows us that there are superheroes or warriors whose duty is to protect people from supernatural threats. They are called "Red Daggers". The distinctive feature of the Red Daggers is they use red cloth to cover their mouth, their faces.

Further in episode 4, at the Karachi Station, A young man appears, about the same age as Kamala. He covered part of his face, with a red cloth. He has super power as like Kamala. First, he thinks that Kamala is an enemy, a member of Clan Destine. But after knowing it that Kamala is the ancestor of Aisha, her great grandmother, they become friends. Red Dagger is a warrior, a here. Their job is people from supernatural threats (from the unseen).

In the Ms. Marvel series also has other dimensions/realms created by directors. It is just like in Doctor Stranger, which is part of the Avengers series. However, there are differences in the concept of another dimensional world, where, in Ms. Marvel, the concept of dimensions other than Earth, where humans live. The dimensions are separated by 'Noor'. The concept of 'noor' itself means light. It comes from Arabic language. The director uses this concept “Noor” not from English word, or Western concept. It showed in episode four, after Kamala met the Red Daggers. Waleed, the leader of Red Dagger explains about this dimension to Kamala.

The identity of Ms. Marvel where Kamala as the main character in the series, shows the similarities and differences with 'Captain Marvel' in Captain Marvel Movie who is one of the female superheroes in the Avengers. It is said that Captain Marvel is Kamala's inspiration. In the first episode, Kamala wants
to attend a cosplay event featuring the Avengers superheroes. Kamala participates in the event by playing Captain Marvel, her superhero idol. There are differences between Captain Marvel in Avengers series and Ms. Marvel in this series. There is a blend of American superhero concepts with nuances of Pakistani culture.

We can see from Kamala’s costume. In the last episode, Kamala shows with her new costume. In the costume Kamala wears, there is a combined culture in her uniform. The costume, which was sewn by Kamala’s mother, contains some Pakistani history and nuances. First, the material for the costume, Kamala got it from Waleed when he was in Pakistan. Waleed is the leader of Red Daggers, superhero in Pakistan. Waleed gave the 'armour' to Kamala so she would not forget her origins. The lightning symbol, which is the symbol of a piece of Kamala's necklace, which was split when she fought against the Destine Clan. And lastly, the red scarf is also a symbol that distinguishes Captain Marvel in the Avengers and Kamala as Ms. Marvel in this series. And the most important symbol is the bracelet which is inherited from Kamala’s great-grandmother, Aisha, which was passed down by her grandmother. Traditional bracelets, synonymous with Pakistani culture, and have inscriptions written in Urdu.

From this, we can see that there is a third spatial concept of identity put forward by Bhabha, a depiction of Kamala's identity that was constructed by the director.

**Conclusion**

Based on identity analysis in the Ms. Marvel series uses Hall's and Bhabha's theories, there are symbols used by the director which indicate a criticism of the concept of neo-orientalism. Orientalism is no different from old-orientalism in that both view non-West as 'the other'. It is just that in neo-orientalism, the West considers, those who are not part of them are considered radicals/terrorists. In the series of Ms. Marvel which is also a production by the Marvel studio, we can see the symbols of Islam, the background of the players, the settings, the places of this series, and even the director, who is a British-Pakistani. Thus, the symbols of Islam, the religion that appears in Ms. Marvel is a form of criticism of the concept of neo-orientalism carried out by the West against Muslims. Ms. Marvel is a construction of neo-orientalism through the medium of popular culture.

**Reference**

Alatas, S. F. (2012). *The problem of academic dependency: Latin America and the Malay world*


