

CATEGORY SHIFTS IN TRANSLATING ENGLISH COMPLEX NOUN PHRASES IN *UGLY LOVE* NOVEL INTO INDONESIAN

Sunarti Desrieny Tambunan

English Department, Faculty of Letters and Cultures, Universitas Gunadarma

Jl. Margonda Raya 100, Depok 16424, Jawa Barat

sunarti_tambunan@staff.gunadarma.ac.id

Abstract

English noun phrases can be categorized into simple and complex noun phrases. Whether or not a noun phrase is complex, it can be seen from the structure of a noun phrase that has a pre-modification, head, and post-modification or its complementation. However, when it is translated into Indonesian, the shifts happen. In translations, there are two types of shifts. They are level shifts and category shifts. This research is aimed at finding out the complex noun phrases in a novel entitled *Ugly Love* and their category shifts of translation in Indonesian. A descriptive qualitative method was applied in this research. Based on the findings, there are 41 Complex Noun Phrases found. However, there are six (6) Complex Noun Phrases that are translated using category shifts. Two (2) data are translated using structure shift and unit shift. One (1) data is translated using unit shift. One (1) data is translated using unit shift and class shift. Two (2) data are translated using structure shift, class shift, and unit shift. It reveals that the most dominant used of category shift is unit shift, followed by structure shift. Furthermore, the least used of category shift is class shift. In addition, intra-system shift was not found because the nouns mentioned in the data findings are all singular nouns.

Keywords: *Category shifts, complex noun phrases, translation*

INTRODUCTION

Phrases in English are groups of several words consisting of a determiner or pre-modifier with a head noun, or a head noun with a post-modifier. Phrases also consist of several types, one of them is a Noun Phrase (NP). Noun Phrase (NP) is a group of words that has a head phrase, a noun or pronoun (Duwila & Astutik, 2020; Guillerit, 2020). For example, books on the shelf which consists of a head-plural noun *books* and its post-modifier Prepositional Phrase (PP) *on the shelf*. Noun Phrases can be categorized into simple and complex Noun Phrases. It is called a simple noun phrase, syntactically, if it consists of only two (2) words, for example, *the party*, this phrase

consists of a determiner *the* and a head-singular noun *party*, without post-modification. Whether or not a noun phrase is complex, it can be identified through the following sequence: 1. NP without post-modification, 2. NP + PP, 3. NP with non-finite supplements, 4. NP with non-finite clause, and 5. NP with finite clause (*that*, free *wh*-clauses) (Berlage, 2014; Schilk & Schaub, 2016). The same theory is also stated by Durrant & Brenchley (2022) that the complexity mentioned previously can be seen from the structure of a noun phrase that has a pre-modification, head, and post-modification or its complementation. Therefore, a conclusion can be drawn that the least complex of a noun phrase is an NP without post-modification and the most

complex one is an NP with finite clause. Thus, it can also be seen that an NP with a prepositional phrase (PP) is more complex than an NP without post-modification. For this present research, the researcher uses this sequence in finding complex noun phrases and their translation results.

In translation, basically, a phrase in English if translated into Indonesian, a structure shift is automatically applied. For example, the NP *your birthmark*, if it is translated into Indonesian becomes *tanda lahirmu*. Therefore, it is crystal clear that the location of the possessive pronoun *your* shifts to be right on "... *lahirmu*" which is located at the back and the head noun *birthmark* shifts its position to be in the front. This method is common when translating simple phrases because the grammar rules of the target language (*Bahasa Indonesia*) are different, however, it must be reviewed when translating complex noun phrases. Thus, this is the key reason why the researcher is interested and motivated to research the shifts that occur in translating Complex Noun Phrase from English in a novel which has been translated into Indonesian. The researcher will use Catford's theory of Category Shifts as cited in Hartono (2017). In addition, the pattern of noun phrases in English and Indonesian is quite different. For example, the phrase *nuclear power* in English consists of an adjective *nuclear* and the head noun *power* (Parkinson & Parkinson, 2013). However, the pattern of noun phrases in

Indonesian, if the phrase is translated becomes *tenaga nuklir* which consists of a noun *tenaga* and an adjective *nuklir*. As in the example *mawar putih* which consists of a noun *mawar* and an adjective *putih* (*Tata Bahasa Baku Bahasa Indonesia*, 2017).

This phenomenon is called a translation shift. It is the process of translation when the textual equivalent in the target language does not formally correspond with the source language (Panou, 2013). This shift has two (2) major types, they are level shifts and category shifts. This research will focus on category shifts only. Based on Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017) stated that category shifts are divided into four (4) shifts, they are structure shift (the change that involves grammatical structure in SL and TL), class shift (the change that involves different classes between SL and TL), intra-system shift (the change that involves SL and TL with similar constitution, however, when it is translated into TL, it has different term), and unit shift (the change that involves different ranks in SL and TL). As the data source, the researcher has chosen a novel entitled *Ugly Love* (2014) by Colleen Hoover which has been translated by Shandy Tan into Indonesian entitled *Wajah Buruk Cinta* (2016). At first, the researcher is intended to find some additional novels to be used as research sources, however, once it is finished downloaded, the researcher scans chapter by chapter and she is amazed with the translation results which are so reasonable, acceptable

and accurate. Therefore, the researcher decides to use this source and then chose the topic of Complex Noun Phrase and its translation in Indonesian. In addition, this research is aimed at finding out the complex noun phrases in a novel entitled *Ugly Love* and their category shifts of translation in Indonesian.

Many previous researchers have conducted the topic about general noun phrases and the shifts in their translation results. Unfortunately, to support this present research, the researcher only found one previous research with the same topic, namely Darso (2018). He discussed the identification of category shifts in Complex Noun Phrase from English to Indonesian from a novel entitled "The Valley of Fear" using Catford's theory. By using the observation method and the implementation of note taking to find the data along with descriptive methods to analyse them, the findings showed that all types of category shifts (structure shift, class shift, intra-system shift, and unit shift) were found. The conclusion is structure shifts dominated the most among those mentioned shifts. Literal or faithful translation often applied which makes the translation results in target language (TL) are not readable and very stiff. However, the Indonesian version of the novel, the researcher found it quite satisfying with the translation. The translator is brave enough to form of the sentences without losing their original meanings. All translators must follow his trace. Therefore,

this present research will be very useful for students who are now studying translations.

METHODS

This present research uses descriptive qualitative method in analysing the data. Its purpose is to describe a phenomenon and its characteristics (Nassaji, 2015). The data are taken from two versions of a novel entitled *Ugly Love* (2014), the English version, and its Indonesian *Wajah Buruk Cinta* (2016). This novel consists of 39 chapters. Each chapter is divided based on its two main characters, Tate and Miles. The researcher limits her research to read Tate's chapters only that contain Complex Noun Phrases.

To collect the data, some procedures were applied in this research such as reading the English version to find the Complex Noun Phrases based on Berlage (2014), note taking it, and then put it into tables. After finding the data, the researcher continues to read the Indonesian version based on the pages where the Complex Noun Phrases in English version are located. After all data are collected (English (SL) and Indonesian version (TL)), the researcher then comprehends the theory of shift and its categories based on Catford's as cited in Hartono (2017). After comprehending the theory, then the researcher chooses one shift, category shifts, between the two (level and category shifts). The category shifts are still broken down into four (4) types, they are structure shift, class shift, intra system shift,

and unit shift. Then, the researcher eliminates which Complex Noun Phrases are translated using category shifts.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the aims of the research to find out Complex Noun Phrases and their category shifts of translation, it is showed that there are 41 Complex Noun Phrases in the English version of the novel entitled *Ugly Love*. However, there are only six (6) representatives of Complex Noun Phrases that are translated into Indonesian using category shifts. There are two (2) data which are translated using structure shift and unit shift. There is one (1) data which is translated using unit shift. There is one (1) data which is translated using unit shift and class shift. There are two (2) data which are translated using structure shift, class shift, and unit shift.

The following data representatives are all Complex Noun Phrases and the category shifts of translation that occurs. The analysis and description are shown in the following:

Data 1

SL: My eyes widen, and I slowly turn toward **the elderly gentleman standing at my side**.

TL: *Aku membelalak, lalu dengan perlahan berbalik ke arah laki-laki tua yang berdiri di sebelahku.*

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that noun phrases which

set side by side with non-finite clause are in the fourth (4) position as a complex category. In the data above, the source language is ... *the elderly gentleman standing at my side* is a Noun Phrase with a non-finite clause consisting of the determiner *the*, pre-modifier adjective *elderly*, head singular noun *gentleman*, post-modifier 1 adjective *standing*, and post modifier 2 prepositional phrase (PP) *at my side*.

This Complex Noun Phrase is then translated becomes a relative clause ... *laki-laki tua yang berdiri di sebelahku* in the target language (TL) which consists of head noun *laki-laki*, post-modifier 1 adjective *tua*, post-modifier 2 verb phrase (VP) *yang berdiri*, and post-modifier 3 prepositional phrase (PP) *di sebelahku*. Referring to Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017), it can be seen that the shift occurred two (2) times in order to get the correct and accurate translation results. The first category shift, of course, is a structure shift because of the difference in sentence patterns in the TL, namely in the noun phrase *the elderly gentleman* shifted the structure into *laki-laki tua*. The second category shift occurs in translating the post-modification *standing*, from a word into a phrase *yang berdiri* in TL. This shift is called unit shift. Then, the result of the translation of the complex noun phrase itself forms a relative clause in TL.

This process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun

Phrase in source language is ... *the (1) elderly (2) gentleman (3) standing (4) at my side (5)*. Moreover, the pattern in Target Language is ... *laki-laki (3) tua (2) yang berdiri (4) di sebelahku (5)*. From the result of the translation, there is an omission of determiner *the*, however, the meaning is transferred correctly and accurately. Even though the shifts happen multiple times, there is no loss in meaning.

Data 2

SL: He's looking up at the sky, and my eyes focus on **the scar that runs the length of his jaw**.

TL: Miles mendongak ke langit, dan mataku tertuju ke *bekas luka di sepanjang rahangnya*.

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that a noun phrase which set side by side with finite clause is in the fifth (5) of the most complex noun phrase. In the data above, the source language ... *the scar that runs the length of his jaw* is a Complex Noun Phrase with a finite clause which consists of determiner *the*, head noun *scar*, post-modified dependent clause *that runs the length of his jaw* and is translated into a phrase ... *bekas luka di sepanjang rahangnya* in the target language which consists of the noun phrase *bekas luka* and the prepositional phrase (PP) *di sepanjang rahangnya*.

Referring to Catford's theory as cited

in Hartono (2017), it can be seen that the category shifts that occur is a unit shift, namely the head noun *scar* which consist of one word in the SL changed into a phrase *bekas luka* in the TL. Then, the same shifting is also occurred for the dependent clause *that runs the length of his jaw* in the SL shifts into a prepositional phrase (PP) *di sepanjang rahangnya* in the TL. As a unit of Complex Noun Phrase, the category shift that occurs is unit shift too from a finite clause into a phrase *bekas luka di sepanjang rahangnya*. If the translator constrained to follow the original patten of the target language, it will completely lose its meaning.

Furthermore, this process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun Phrase in source language is ... *the (1) scar (2) that runs the length of his jaw (3)*. Moreover, the pattern in Target Language is ... *bekas luka (2) di sepanjang rahangnya (3)*. It can be seen that there are many omissions when the clause is translated into its target language. It seems that it is too difficult to stick with its original unit and find the equivalent for the verb *runs* because *scar* is often related to where it is located. It is unique that it is more accurate and understandable despite the omission. Thus, it can be concluded that there is a shift in units from words to phrases, from clauses to phrases, and as a whole, from finite clause into a phrase consisting of NP and PP.

Data 3

SL: The hand with the wedding ring on it.

TL: *Tangan yang di jemarinya tersemat cincin kawin.*

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that a noun phrase which set side by side with prepositional phrase (PP), it is positioned in the second (2nd) because it is more complex than an NP without post-modification. Based on the data above, the source language *The hand with the wedding ring on it* is a Complex Noun Phrase which consists of determiner *the*, head noun *hand*, post-modifier prepositional phrase 1 (PP) *with the wedding ring* post-modifier prepositional phrase 2 (PP) *on it* and it is translated into a complex sentence *Tangan yang di jemarinya tersemat cincin kawin*. In the target language. It consists of a head noun *tangan*, a dependent clause *yang di jemarinya*, a verb *tersemat*, and a noun phrase *cincin kawin*.

Referring to Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017), it is completely impossible if the target language is translated literally. The meaning will completely loss. Even though *hand* is the head, specifying where a wedding ring is usually put is the best way to do. Thus, the category shifts that occur is unit shift as a whole unit, it is from Complex Noun Phrase becomes a complex sentence in the Target Language. However, there is also an addition explanation where the shifting of class occurred. It is the Noun Phrase *wedding ring* which consists of an Adjective and a

Noun. When the adjective *wedding* is translated into the target language becomes a noun *kawin*.

This process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun Phrase in source language is *The (1) hand (2) with the wedding ring on it (3)*. Moreover, the pattern in Target Language is *Tangan (2) yang di jemarinya tersemat cincin kawin (3)*. Another shifting in class is also found in the prepositional phrase *on it* shifted to be a verb *tersemat*. Moreover, the structure shift is found in *the wedding ring*. The position, after the translation, is located at the end of the phrase. Moreover, there is an addition of a dependent clause *yang dijemarinya* in the target language. It marks the sentence in TL is now a complex sentence. A conclusion can be drawn that unit shift and class shift occurred for the post modification part. Even though determiner *the* is omitted, it does not affect the result of the translation. It is acceptable and accurate.

Data 4

SL: We've got a **new student who just enrolled**, and she also has Mr. Clayton this period. ...

TL: *Kita mendapat murid perempuan baru, dia juga masuk kelas Mr. Clayton. ...*

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that a noun phrase which set side by side with finite clause is in the

fifth (5) of the most complex noun phrase. Based on the data above, the source language ... *a new student who just enrolled*, ... is Complex Noun Phrase with finite clause and consists of a determiner *a*, pre-modifier adjective *new*, head noun *student*, post modifier-infinite clause *who just enrolled* and it is translated into a simple noun phrase ... *murid perempuan baru*, ... in the target language which consists of a noun phrase *murid perempuan* and its attributive adjective *baru*.

Referring to Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017), the first shifting of the category is structure shift for the noun phrase *new student* in source language becomes *murid baru* in the target language. In addition, as a whole unit, the unit shift from high to low level occurred. It is from a clause into simple noun phrase. The reason could be to avoid redundancy or repetition for the word *baru* as in *murid perempuan baru yang baru saja mendaftar*. In addition, there is also an addition for the word *perempuan* in the target language to specify more about the new student. This addition seems to be in accordance with the pronoun *she* in the second clause in SL. In SL, the pronoun *she* refers to a girl, however, in TL, the word *perempuan* must be added in order to specify who it refers to. This also could be a matter of culture.

This process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun Phrase in source language is ... *a (1) new (2)*

student (3) who just enrolled (4), ... Moreover, the pattern in Target Language is ... *murid perempuan (3) baru (2)*, ... It can be seen that determiner *a* and the finite clause *who just enrolled* are omitted in the target language. Although the shifting occurred is quite significant, the result of the translation is still acceptable.

Data 5

SL: I want to hide them in a mind drawer and label it Things to pull out and read when **his stupid rule number two** becomes a sad and lonely present.

TL: *Aku ingin menyembunyikan kata-kata itu di laci pikiranku dan memberinya label Hal-hal untuk dikeluarkan dan dibaca ketika aturan bodoh nomor dua yang dibuat Miles menjadi masa kini yang menyedihkan dan membuat kesepian.*

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that a noun phrase which set side by side with prepositional phrase (PP), it is positioned in the second (2nd) because it is more complex than an NP without post-modification. Based on the data above, the source language ... *his stupid rule number two*, ... is a Complex Noun Phrase with a Noun Phrase as its post-modification. It consists of a possessive pronoun *his*, pre-modifier adjective *stupid*, head noun *rule*, post-modifier noun phrase *number two* and it is translated into a passive sentence ... *aturan bodoh nomor dua yang dibuat Miles*, ... in the target language.

Referring to Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017), the category shifts that occur is structure shift in noun phrase *stupid rule* in the source language becomes *aturan bodoh* in the target language. The phrase *number two* in the SL is translated without shifting into *nomor dua* in the TL. If it shifted *dua nomor* by following the usual shift in structure, then the meaning is completely different than the phrase *nomor dua*. Class shift occurs in translating the possessive pronoun adjective *his* which must be followed by a noun in the source language becomes an object *Miles* in the TL. The third category shift as a whole unit is unit shift. It is from a phrase into a passive sentence.

This process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun Phrase in source language is ... *his (1) stupid (2) rule (3) number two (4)*... Moreover, the pattern in the Target Language is ... *aturan (3) bodoh (2) nomor dua (4) yang dibuat Miles (1)*, Sebagai penjelasan tambahan, if we follow the original pattern *his stupid rule* in SL, it is also possible to translate it as *aturan bodohnya* in TL. However, based on the context, it is stated that this complex noun phrase is a label. A label usually contains specific information. Therefore, the translator shifts the possessive pronoun *his* into *yang dibuat Miles* which is a clause in the target language. Thus, whoever reads the label, it is crystal clearly made by *Miles*. This shift adds

the quality of the translation without make people confused about the rule maker. From the translation result above, it can be concluded that there is a shift in units from a complex noun phrase to a clause. Even though there are some additions, the meaning conveyed is still in accordance with the SL.

Data 6

SL: He continues walking until he reaches a **wooden trifold screen, decorated with Asian writing on the outside.**

TL: *Miles terus berjalan hingga tiba di sekat berkaki tiga dari kayu, sisi luarnya dihiasi tulisan dari wilayah Asia.*

Associated with Berlage's theory (2014) which stated that a noun phrase which set side by side with (non-finite) supplements is categorized as a complex one and positioned the third comparing to an NP with PP or AP. Based on the data above, the source language ... *a wooden trifold screen, decorated with Asian writing on the outside* is a Complex Noun Phrase which consists of determiner *a*, pre-modifier adjective *wooden*, pre-modifier adjective *trifold*, head noun *screen*, post-modifier non-finite supplements *decorated with Asian writing on the outside*. It is translated into ... *di sekat berkaki tiga dari kayu, sisi luarnya dihiasi tulisan dari wilayah Asia* in the target language.

Referring to Catford's theory as cited in Hartono (2017), the category shifts that

occur is unit shift from a noun phrase *a wooden trifold screen* into a prepositional phrase (PP) *di sekat berkaki tiga dari kayu* in the target language. This shifting occurs because of the verb *reaches* which means *to arrive at a place*, it is crystal clear that this verb has a strong connection with a place. In addition, class shift is also found in adjective *wooden* becomes a noun *kayu* and unit shift is found in adjective *trifold* in the SL becomes a phrase *berkaki tiga* in the TL. It is also clear the structure shift that occur in the phrase *a wooden trifold screen* in the SL becomes *sekat berkaki tiga dari kayu* in the TL. Furthermore, supplement in the SL *decorated with Asian writing on the outside* to describe more about the head noun *screen* is translated into a passive sentence *sisi luarnya dihiasi tulisan dari wilayah Asia* in the target language. For this non-finite supplement, the unit shift occurs. It is from a clause into a passive sentence.

This process can also be numbered in order to make it easier to comprehend the shift. The pattern of the Complex Noun Phrase in source language is ... *a (1) wooden (2) trifold (3) screen (4), decorated with Asian writing on the outside (5)*. Moreover, the pattern in the Target Language is ... *di sekat (4) berkaki tiga (3) dari kayu (2), sisi luarnya dihiasi tulisan dari wilayah Asia (5)*. The category shifts that are found in this data are class shift, unit shift dan structure shift. Even though the shifts happen multiple times, there is no loss in meaning.

CONCLUSION

This research aims to find out Complex Noun Phrases in a novel entitled *Ugly Love* and their category shifts of translation in Indonesian entitled *Wajah Buruk Cinta*. Based on the findings, there are 41 Complex Noun Phrases found in the novel. However, there are only six (6) data are translated using category shifts of translation. There are two (2) data which are translated using structure shift and unit shift. There is one (1) data which is translated using unit shift. There is one (1) data which is translated using unit shift and class shift. There are two (2) data which are translated using structure shift, class shift, and unit shift.

From the findings, it can be concluded that translating a phrase by using a structure shift is unavoidable unless the head noun is accompanied by a determiner such as the article “a, an, the”. However, when a noun phrase is set side by side with a prepositional phrase (PP) or an adjective phrase (AP), no shift is found. Then, any determiners in English that are set side by side with the head noun are removed in Indonesian without losing its meaning. Moreover, many complex noun phrases found are translated into Indonesian without the use of category shifts.

This present research reveals that the most dominant used of category shift is unit shift, followed by structure shift. Moreover, the least used of category shift is class shift. In addition, intra-system shift was not found because the nouns mentioned in the data

findings are singular nouns. For the next researcher, it is recommended to study other complex phrases such as verb phrases (VP), Adjective Phrase (AP), Prepositional Phrase (PP) or Adverbial Phrase (AdvP) and their translation into Indonesian. Implementing this will increase knowledge and experience and also awareness that the phrase patterns in English are different significantly in Indonesian.

REFERENCES

- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa, Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan. (2017). *Tata Bahasa Baku Bahasa Indonesia* Edisi ke-4.
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa: Jakarta.
- Berlage, E. (2014). *Noun Phrase Complexity in English*. Cambridge University Press: UK.
- Darso, D. (2018). Category Shifts in Translation: A Case Study on The Translation of English Complex Noun Phrases into Indonesian. *Lingua Scientia*, 25 (1), 11-19.
- Durrant, P., & Brenchley, M. (2022). Development of Noun Phrase Complexity Across Genres in Children's Writing. *Applied Linguistics*, XX/XX, 1–27.
- Duwila, Shanty A. Y. P. S., & Astutik, Ari. (2020). The Post-Modification of Noun Phrase: Types and Distributions on Abstracts of Local and International Journals. *Mozaik Humaniora*, 21 (1), 100-107.
- Guillerit, M. (2020). An exploratory analysis of noun phrases in civil engineering writing. *ASp*, 77, 55-47. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.4000/asp.6272>
- Hartono, R. (2017). *Pengantar Ilmu Menerjemah (Teori dan Praktek Penerjemahan)*. Cipta Prima Nusantara: Semarang.
- Hoover, C. (2014). *Ugly Love*. Atria Books: UK.
- Nassaji, H. (2015). Qualitative and descriptive research: Data type versus data analysis. *Language Teaching Research*, 19 (2), 129–132.
- Panou, D. (2013). Equivalence in Translation Theories: A Critical Evaluation. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 3 (1), 1-6.
- Parkinson, J., & Musgrave, J. (2013). Development of noun phrase complexity in the writing of English for Academic Purposes students. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 14 (2014), 48–59.
- Schilk, M., & Schaub, S. (2016). *Noun phrase complexity across varieties of English*. 37 (1), 58–85. doi 10.1075/eww.37.1.03sch.
- Tan, S. (2016). *Wajah Buruk Cinta*. PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama: Jakarta.