# AN ERROR ANALYSIS ON THE ENGLISH DIRECT AND INDIRECT SPEECH IN THE PAST TENSE FORM

## **ABSTRAK**

This research is analyzing errors made by the students in answering the past tense form of English direct and indirect speech. The aim of this research is to find out how many errors made by the students in answering the questions of English direct and indirect speech in the past tense form. The population is the first year students of the faculty of Economy majoring Accounting, Gunadarma University, namely 1EB 11 and 1EB13. The number of population is 88 students which is 43 students from 1EB11 and 45 students from 1 EB13. 50 students are choosen as the sample. The data analysis will show the result of the occurence of errors made by the sample by giving the numbers of students who made errors, then giving the explanation of the correct answer, and interpreting the data. The result shows that most students still found difficulties in answering the questions. Errors happened more in changing the sentence from the direct speech to indirect speech in the form of simple past than in the form of past perfect tense.

Key Words: Error Analysis, Simple Past, Past Perfect, Direct Indirect Speech.

# **Suci Budiwaty**

Faculty of Letters, Gunadarma University suci\_budiwaty@staff.gunadarma.ac.id

#### **INTRODUCTION**

This research is conducted to find out how many errors occured in answering the questions of direct and indirect speech in the past tense form. Since the students have already been given the materials in the highschool, so the writer would like to know how far the students understood and able to answer the direct and indirect questions especially in the form of simple past tense and past perfect tense.

There are set of rules in answering the direct question into indirect sentence, where the students must change the form of pronoun, verb, tenses, posessive and adverb of time. These are problems that are faced by the students. Sometimes they don't pay attention to the subject or object in direct speech. They also didn't change the pronoun, verb form, possessive and also adverb of time in indirect speech.

The problem of this research is "do the students master the direct and indirect speech in the past tense form?" The aim of this research is to find out how many students who made errors in answering questions of direct speech into indirect speech in the past tense form, especially simple past tense and past perfect tense.

This research was conducted to the first year students of faculty of Economy, Gunadarma University, majoring Accounting namely 1 EB 11 and 1 EB 13. The population is 88 students. There are 43 students from 1 EB 11 and 45 students from 1 EB 13. The sample drawn from this population is 50 students, taken randomly. This research only focuses on the affirmative and interogative sentences in the past tense form, they are simple past tense, and past perfect tense.

According to James (1998) error analysis has to do with the investigation of the language of the second language learners and historically shows the course of development of ideas about learners' less than total success in foreign language or source language learning.

Error analysis is the process of determining the incidence, nature, causes,

and consequences of unsuccessful language. Joanna Huang(2002) said that language learning is actually a process of trial and error, in which a learner from a hypothesis and later on prove it, abort it or adjust it. The error analysis study, therefore, is to examine a learner's errors in a longitudinal way in order to state the individual learner's hypothesis and locate the progress s/he is making.

Based on Longman dictionary of language teaching and applied linguistics (2002), error analysis is the study and analysis of the errors made by the second language learners. Error analysis maybe carried out in order to identify strategies which learners use in language learning, to identify the causes of learners' errors and to obtain information on common difficulties in language learning as an aid to teaching or in the preparation of teaching materials.

Maier (2009) said that English direct discourse is easily recognized by, for example, the lack of a complimentizer, the quotation marks (or the inonational contour those induce), and verbatim ('shifted) pronouns. English indirect course is usually marked by a complimentizer "that". As cited from Bergler (2006) that a complement is optionally introduced by "that" for indirect reported speech, and it is surrounded by quotation marks for direct reported speech.

Azar (1992) said that direct speech refers to reproducing another person's exact words, while indirect speech refers to reproducing the idea of another person's words. Not all the exact words are used: verb form and pronouns may change. So, it can be said that in English, the speaker's words in direct speech may be written between quotation marks, while in indirect speech, the speaker's words are not reported as they were actually said but are reported form.

According to Azar (1992) simple past is the activities or situations that began and ended at a particular time in the past. Simple past tense in direct speech is

changed into past perfect in the indirect sentence. Past perfect is the activities that occured before another time in the past. The past perfect tense in direct speech doesn't change the tense in indirect speech.

#### **RESEARCH METHOD**

This research uses descriptive quantitative study. The population is the first year students of faculty of Economy majoring Accounting namely 1 EB 11 and 1 EB 13, Gunadarma University in academic year of 2010-2011. The population is 88 students. There are 43 students from 1 EB 11 and 45 students from 1 EB 13. The sample drawn from this population is 50 students, taken randomly.

In collecting the data the research uses a written test on direct and indirect speech in the form of Simple Past Tense and Past Perfect Tense, consisting of 10 questions in affirmative and interogative sentences. The answers of the respondents' written tests are used as the instrument of the research. The writer classifies the data into three categories, they are: 1). Analysis of the errors in Direct and Indirect Speech in the form of Simple Past Tense; 2). Analysis of Errors in Direct and Indirect Speech in the form of Past Perfect Tense; 3). Data Interpretation.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The test consisted of questions in direct speech and the students must answer to its indirect speech in the form of Simple Past Tense and Past Perfect Tense in affirmative and interogative sentences. The questions consist of 10 questions in the form of essay, and the time given to do the test is 30 minutes.

Analysis of the Errors in Direct and Indirect Speech in the form of Simple Past Tense

# **Question no. 1:**

Direct: Jane said to me,"I wondered why

John didn't come to your party last night." Indirect: \_\_\_\_

**Answer:** Jane said to me that she had wondered why John hadn't come to my party the previous night.

The pronoun subject "I" in direct speech is changed into "she" in indirect speech, since the speaker is Jane, as a woman. And the pronoun object "you" is changed into "me" in indirect speech since Jane was talking to me. The verb form "wondered" become "had wondered" because the simple past tense in direct speech must change into past perfect tense in indirect speech. The possessive adjective "your" is changed into "my" since Jane is talking to me, means that I who have the party. The adverb of time "last night" is changed into "the previous night" as the adverb of time in indirect speech.

The result shows that 19 students answered correctly and 31 students gave the wrong answers.

#### Question no. 2:

Direct: Bill asked me," Did you finish your work?"

. Indirect:

**Answer:** Bill asked me whether I had finished my work.

"Whether" is used after "asked" to introduce a noun clause. The pronoun subject "you" is changed into "I" since Bill was asking me. The simple past interogative sentence in direct speech must change into past perfect affirmative sentence in indirect speech. So that the verb form is changed into "had finished". The possessive adjective "your" is changed into "my" since Bill was asking me, so that I who have the work.

The result shows that 10 students answered correctly and 40 students gave the wrong answers.

# Question no. 3:

Direct: John said to Jane," I wrote about our journey last year."

Indirect: \_

**Answer:** John said to Jane that he had written about their journey the previous year.

The pronoun subject "I" is changed into "he" since John is man and as the speaker. The verb form "wrote" is changed into "had written" because verb form in simple past must change into the verb form in past perfect. The possessive "our" is changed into "their" because John was talking to Jane, and the listener is the third person. The adverb of time "last year" is changed into "the previous year", because it is the adverb of time in indirect speech.

The result shows that 30 students answered correctly and 20 students gave the wrong answers.

## Question no.4:

Direct: Jim said to me,"I spent all my money on my vacation last week." Indirect:

**Answer:** Jim said to me that he had spent all his money on his vacation the previous week.

The pronoun subject "I" is changed into "he" since Jim, as a man, is the speaker. The verb form "spent" is changed into "had spent' because verb form in simple past must change into the verb form in past perfect. The adjective possessive "my" is changed into "his" because Jim is the speaker, so it is Jim who has the vacation. The adverb of time "last week" is changed into "the previous week" as it is the adverb of time in indirect speech.

The result shows that 29 students answered correctly and 21 students gave the wrong answers.

#### Question no.5:

Direct: Mary asked to Adam," Did you watch my program on TV last night?' Indirect: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Answer:** Mary asked to Adam if he had watched her program on TV the night before."

"If" is used after "asked" to introduce a noun clause. The pronoun subject "you" is changed into "he" since Mary was asking Adam. The simple past interogative sentence in direct speech must change into past perfect affirmative sentence in indirect speech. So that the verb form is changed into "had watched". The possessive adjective "my" is changed into "her" since Mary,a woman, who has the program.

The result shows that 11 students answered correctly and 42 students gave the wrong answers.

## Analysis of the Errors in Direct and Indirect Speech in the form of Past Perfect Tense

## Question no. 6:

Direct: Jill said to me,"I had waited for you at your office for an hour." Indirect:

**Answer:** Jill said to me that she had waited for me at my office for an hour.

The pronoun subject "I" is changed into "she" since Jill is the speaker. The verb form "had waited" is not changed because verb form of past perfect tense in direct speech doesn't change in indirect speech. The object "you" is changed into "me" in indirect, because the speaker is talking to me (as object). The possessive "your" is changed into "my" because Jill was talking to me, and it is me who have the office.

The result shows that 25 students answered correctly and 25 students gave the wrong answers.

# Question no. 7:

Direct: Johny asked Mary, "had you heard my new song?"
Indirect:

**Answer:** Johny asked Mary whether she had heard his new song.

"Whether" is used after "asked" to introduce a noun clause. The pronoun subject "you" is changed into "she" since Johny was asking Mary (a woman). The past perfect interogative sentence in direct speech must change into past perfect affirmative sentence in indirect speech. So that the verb form is not changed. The possessive adjective "my" is changed into "his" since Johny, a man, who possesses the song.

The result shows that 22 students answered correctly and 28 students gave the wrong answers.

#### Question no. 8:

Direct: Danny said to Wanda," I had delivered all packages in that room since yesterday"

Indirect:

**Answer:** Danny said to Wanda that he had delivered all packages in this room since the day before.

The pronoun subject "I" is changed into "he" since Danny is a man and he is the speaker. The verb form "had delivered" is not changed because verb form of past perfect tense in direct speech doesn't change in indirect speech. The adjective "that" in direct speech is changed into "this " in indirect speech. The adverb "yesterday" is changed into "the day before" in indirect speech.

The result shows that 35 students answered correctly and 15 students gave the wrong answer.

# Question no.9:

Direct: Tom asked Kathy," Had you known that new student?"

Indirect: \_\_\_\_\_\_Answer: Tom asked Kathy whether she had known this new student.

"Whether" is used after "asked" to introduce a noun clause. The pronoun subject "you" is changed into "she" since Tom was asking Kathy (a woman). The past perfect interogative sentence in direct speech must change into past perfect affirmative sentence in indirect speech. So that the verb form is not changed. The adjective demonstrative "that" is changed into "this" in indirect speech.

The result shows that 17 students answered correctly and 33 students gave the wrong answer.

## Question no. 10:

Direct: Eddy said to Casey" I had told Jane about our plan to have vacation to Bali".

Indirect:

**Answer:** Eddy said to Casey that he had told Jane about their plan to have vacation to Bali.

The pronoun subject "I" is changed into "he" since Eddy, as a man, is the speaker. The verb form "had told" is not changed because verb form of past perfect tense in direct speech doesn't change in indirect speech. The possessive adjective "our" in direct speech is changed into "their " in indirect speech, because the plan is belong to Eddy and Casey.

The result shows that 26 students answered correctly and 24 students gave the wrong answer.

#### **Data Interpretation**

Table 1.
Percentage of Simple Past Tense Error

Q.No.	Error answer in simple past tense	Percentage (%)
1.	31	62%
2.	40	80%
3.	20	40%
4.	21	42%
5.	42	84%

From the table above, it can be seen that 62% error happened in answering question number 1, because they didn't know who is the subject. The possessive adjective and adverb of time must change into indirect speech form. 80% error happened in answering question number 2, because the question is in the form of interogative. Besides changing the verb form into past perfect, direct interrogative sentence must change into affirmative sentence in indirect speech. So that the student made an error in answering the question because they don't know the procedure. 40% error happened in answering question number 3, because the students gave the wrong answer in changing the possessive adjective. 42% error happened in answering question number 4, the error happened in changing the adverb of time. 84% error happened in answering question number 5, because the question is in the direct interrogative sentence, where students must change the sentence into indirect affirmative sentence. Most of them didn't change it. It shows that they didn't understand how to change it.

Error happened more in answering the direct interrogative question into affirmative question, 80% error in answering number 2 and 84% error in answering number 5. It happened because the students didn't know the procedure or didn't understand how to change the sentence into affirmative sentence.

The student also have to change the verb form from simple past tense into past perfect tense. Means that they still didn't understand how to change it. Cited from Zibakenar (2013) that punctuation, capitalization, spelling, subject-verb agreement, tense, the use of connectors, pronouns and possessives can influence in writing accuracy. This also happened in analysing errors in direct indirect

Table.2 Percentage of Past Perfect Tense Error

Q.No.	Error answer in past perfect tense	Percentage (%)
6.	25	50%
7.	28	56%
8.	15	30%
9.	33	66%
10.	24	48%

speech that less understanding in using tenses, subject-verb agreement, pronouns and possessives can influence the students in making errors.

50% error happened in answering question number 6, because the students didn't change the possessive adjective into indirect form. 56% error happened in answering question number 7, because the question is in interrogative sentence while the student must change it into affirmative sentence. They also made error in changing the possessive adjective.

30% error happened in answering question number 8, because the students only made error in changing the adverb of time. 66% error happened in answering question number 9, because the question is in interrogative sentence while the student must change it into affirmative sentence. They also made error in changing the adjective demonstrative "this" into "that". 48% error happened in answering question number 10, because the students made error in changing the direct possessive adjective into indirect.

The percentage shows that 56% error happened in answering number 7 and 66% error happened in answering number 9. The questions are in the form of interrogative. So that students have to change the direct interrogative sentence into affirmative sentence in indirect speech. It shows that students still have weakness in changing the pattern of the sentence from interrogative into affirmative sentence.

Cited from Mourssi (2013) that the points of weakness or mistakes made by the learners can change the teaching method of the teacher. This research shows that students still have weakness in changing the verb form, the pronouns or the possessives from direct sentences into indirect sentences. The weakness of the students can become the input for the teacher to change his/her teaching method. So that the student will be easier in understanding direct and indirect speech.

## **CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION**

## **Conclusion**

It can be seen from the table of percentage above that in Table 1, it shows that in answering question number 2, 80%

error happened, and in answering question number 5, 84% error happened, means that the error happened more in answering the direct interrogative sentence in simple past form into indirect affirmative sentence in the form of past perfect tense.

Most of the students made error. From the Table 2, it shows that 56% error happened in answering number 7 and 66% error happened in answering number 9. The question also in the form of direct interrogative sentence, so that they have to change it into indirect affirmative sentence, but they don't have to change the verb form. That is why error happened more in changing verb form in simple past tense into past perfect tense.

## **Suggestion**

Since this research needs further research in analyzing error in direct and indirect speech in the form of future tense, the writer would like to suggest to the other writer to make a research of the related topic with the category above.

#### **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Azar, Betty Schrampfer. 2002. Fundamentals of English Grammar. Pearson ESL: USA.

Bergler, Sabine. 2006. Retrieval Conveying Attitude with Reported Speech. Computing

Attitude and Effect in Text: Theory and Applications. *The Information Retrieval Series.vol.20*, 2006, pp 11-22.Concordia University.

Huang, Joanna. 2002. Error Analysis in English Teaching: A Review of Studies. Journal of Chung-San

James, Carl. 1998. Errors in Language Learning and Use: Exploring Error Analysis. Longman Publishing Ltd.: New York.

Maier, Emar. 2009. Japanese Reported Speech: Against a Direct-Indirect Distinction. Lecturer notes in computer science in Advances in Natural Language Processing vol.5221,pp. 40-51. University of Amsterdam.

Mourssi, Anwar. 2013. The Efficacy of Ex-Implicit in between Implicit and Explicit Grammar Teaching Approach on Second/Foreign Language Learners' Writing. The International Journal of Language Learning and Applied Linguistics World (IJLLALW)vol.2(2). Bristol.

Richards, Jack C and Richard Schmidz. 2002. Dictionary of Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics. Pearson Education Ltd.: England